Keith Banting, Will Kymlicka, Richard Johnston and Stuart Soroka. 2006. "Do Multiculturalism Policies erode the welfare state? An empirical analysis." Pp. 49-91 in Keith Banting and Will Kymlicka, eds., Multiculturalism and the Welfare et al. (Example 1) Recognition and Redistribution in Advanced Democracies. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006.

Banting, Johnston, Kymlicka, and Soroka

Social outcomes. The measures of child poverty and inequality refer to patterns after government taxes and transfers are taken into account. Data are from the LIS website, as downloaded on 21 June 2005. In the LIS database, the poverty line is set at 50 per cent of median adjusted disposable income for all persons. Appendix 2.3 reports the child poverty rate, defined as the percentage of all children in poverty, for specific periods (e.g. the early 1980s). The figures for 'change' in Tables 2.1-2.3 are the change in the rate of child poverty between the earliest and latest data available for each country. In this calculation, a change from a child poverty rate of 6 per cent in the earliest period to 8 per cent in the latest period is a change of 2. Data on inequality are for disposable income for all households, the LIS aggregate income variable labelled DPI. Figures for specific periods in Appendix 2.3 (e.g. early 1980s) are gini coefficients, a measure of inequality in which the higher the number, the greater the level of inequality. Figures for 'change' in Tables 2.1-2.3 are the percentage change in the gini coefficient for the earliest and latest periods available for each country (i.e. the change between the earliest and the latest gini coefficients expressed as a per cent of the earliest gini coefficient).

Demographic data

Data on the size of immigrant minorities are based on United Nations estimates of 'foreign-born migrant stock'. Data on the size of national minorities and indigenous minorities are from Minority Rights Group 1997.

Other variables

The regressions in Tables 2.5 and 2.6 also include the following: (1) left parties in government, drawn from Duane Swank's *Comparative Parties* Dataset and updated to 2001 using recent electoral results; (2) female labour force participation, drawn from OECD *Labour Statistics*, and (3) population over 64 years, drawn from OECD *Health Data*.

The sample of countries

Countries included in the analysis are Western democracies, and had democratic political institutions throughout the period under study (1980 to 2000). The primary limitation on inclusion in the sample was availability of data. Data on redistribution were available for only twelve countries. However, other countries were included in the analysis of the evolution of the welfare state if data on both social spending and social outcomes measures were available. See Appendix 2.3 for details.

Appendix 2.3. Welfare state indicators: Social spending, redistribution,

% CDP Reduction in poverty Reduction in poverty <th>Country</th> <th>Public exper</th> <th>Public social expenditures</th> <th>Redis</th> <th>Redistribution</th> <th>_</th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th> <th>Social</th> <th>Social outcomes</th> <th>SS</th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th>	Country	Public exper	Public social expenditures	Redis	Redistribution	_						Social	Social outcomes	SS					
1980 2000 Early Late Early Late Early Late Early Late Early 2000 Early Late Early 2000 Early Late Early 2000 Early Late Early 2000 Early 2000 Early Late Early 2000 2000 31.2 4.8 9.7 7.8 200 2000 2000 31.2 4.8 9.7 7.8 200 2000 </td <td></td> <td>g %</td> <td>9</td> <td>Redu (%)</td> <td>ction in</td> <td>poverty</td> <td></td> <td>Reduc (%)</td> <td>tion in ir</td> <td>nequality</td> <td></td> <td>Child 1</td> <td>poverty r</td> <td>ate</td> <td></td> <td>Inequa</td> <td>lity efficient</td> <td></td> <td></td>		g %	9	Redu (%)	ction in	poverty		Reduc (%)	tion in ir	nequality		Child 1	poverty r	ate		Inequa	lity efficient		
11.3 18.6 61.7 62.2 62.3 29.0 29.0 31.2 13.8 15.0 15.8 227 280 22.5 26.0 24.1 26.7 88.0 82.8 82.8 50.1 45.9 4.0 18.8 15.0 17.8 13.8 15.0 7.8 227 280 24.1 26.7 17.2 81.1 85.8 61.3 23.2 26.9 14.8 15.3 14.9 284 227 280 29.1 28.3 77.1 81.1 85.8 46.8 48.4 42.6 6.9 14.8 15.3 14.9 284 232 224 21.1 28.3 77.1 81.1 85.8 46.8 48.4 42.6 6.9 8.3 7.9 2.8 239 2.9 2.8 2.3 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.9 2.9 2.		1980	1	Early 80s	Late 80s	Early 90s	2000	Early 80s	Late 80s	Early 90s	2000	Early 80s	Late 80s	Early 90s	2000	Early 80s	Late		2000
24.1 26.7 88.0 82.8 82.8 50.1 45.9 4.0 4.8 9.7 7.8 20.1 3.0 20.1 45.9 4.0 4.8 9.7 7.8 20.1 20.4 3.8 4.6 6.7 22.7 232 224 227 228 229 14.8 14.8 14.8 15.3 14.9 284 287 289 229	Australia Austria	11.3	18.6	61.7	62.2	62.3		29.0	29.0	31.2		13.8	15.0	15.8		281	3 2	3 3	
14.3 17.3 51.1 59.0 63.2 61.2 26.9 49.0 4.0 3.8 4.6 67 227 232 224 29.1 28.9 71.7 81.1 85.8 46.8 48.4 42.6 2.8 2.3 4.6 6.7 22.7 232 224 21.1 28.3 77.1 75.0 80.9 36.5 39.5 40.6 6.9 8.3 7.9 2.8 2.0 21.0 23.0 27.2 82.2 80.3 77.7 79.1 37.1 39.0 41.0 42.6 2.8 2.3 2.8 2.0 22.0 22.0 23.0 27.2 82.2 80.3 77.7 79.1 37.1 39.0 41.0 42.6 2.8 2.3 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8 2.8	Belgium	24.1	26.7			88.0	8 6 8			,			4.8	9.7	7.8	7	227	280	260
29.1 28.9 71.7 81.1 36.2 46.0 46.8 48.4 42.6 6.9 8.3 14.9 284 281 281 21.1 28.3 77.1 84.1 84.1 85.8 46.8 48.4 42.6 2.8 2.3 2.8 23.2 23.2 23.2 23.2 23.2 23.2 20.0 27.1 236 23.2 23.3 2.8 20.0 27.1 236 23.2	Canada	14.3	17.3	51.1	59.0	63.7	0.2.0	23.7	0 90	30.	45.9	0.4	8. 9	4.6	6.7	.227	.232	.224	.277
18.5 24.5 84.1 84.1 85.8 46.8 48.4 42.6 4.7 5.0 254 236 236 236 236 236 236 236 236 236 236 236 236 236 236 236 237 236 237 238 238 237 238 238 237 238 238 237 238 237 238 238 237 238 238 237 238 238 238 238 238 238 <th< td=""><td>Denmark</td><td>29.1</td><td>28.9</td><td></td><td>71.7</td><td>81.1</td><td>?</td><td>1.04</td><td>36.7</td><td>0.00</td><td>6.02</td><td>×.</td><td>8.4</td><td>15.3</td><td>14.9</td><td>.284</td><td>.283</td><td>.281</td><td>.302</td></th<>	Denmark	29.1	28.9		71.7	81.1	?	1.04	36.7	0.00	6.02	×.	8.4	15.3	14.9	.284	.283	.281	.302
21.1 28.3 77.1 75.0 80.9 36.5 39.5 40.6 42.6 2.8 2.3 2.8 2.9 27.0 27.0 27.0 27.0 27.0 27.2 288 287 288 287 288 287 288 287 288 287 288 287 288 287 288 287 288 287 288 287 288 287 288 287 288 286 88.7 88.7 28.7 44.1 40.6 43.6 2.7 5.2 8.1 9.8 2.6 2.96 2.7 2.8 11.4 14.0 16.6 306 2.90 2.96 2.96 2.96 2.96 2.96 2.96 2.96 2.96 2.96 2.96 2.97 3.36 3.36 3.36 3.36 3.36 3.36 3.36 3.36 3.36 3.36 3.38 3.38 3.38 3.38 3.38 3.38 3.38 3.38 3.38	Finland	18.5	24.5		84.1	84.1	85.8		46.8	48.4	7 67		7.6	5.0			.254	.236	
23.0 27.2 82.2 80.3 77.7 79.1 37.1 39.0 41.0 42.6 2.8 4.3 7.9 2.8 2.87 2.88 2.87 2.88 1.87 2.88 1.87 2.88 2.87 2.88 2.87 2.88 2.87 2.88 2.87 2.88 2.87 2.88 2.87 2.87 2.87 2.87 2.87 2.87 2.8	France	21.1	28.3	77.1	75.0	80.9		36.5	30.5	40.4	2		× ×	2.3	7.8		.209	.210	.247
17.0 13.6 18.4 24.1 95.5 99.0 244 257 272 18.4 24.1 95.5 99.0 244 257 272 18.4 24.1 13.8 14.6 17.2 33.8 33.3 26.9 21.8 89.7 87.2 83.0 76.7 44.7 46.1 40.6 43.6 2.7 5.2 8.1 9.8 260 256 250 15.9 19.9 74.2 78.2 79.9 33.8 38.2 38.2 4.8 4.3 5.2 3.4 223 233 231 28.8 28.6 85.7 80.3 83.9 82.7 52.1 49.1 50.3 4.8 4.8 3.5 3.0 4.2 229 17.9 21.7 77.2 65.0 71.7 36.3 29.4 31.0 4.8 3.5 30.4 4.2 13.6 13.3 14.2 40.0 44.6 42.2 22.5 23.6 21.5 25.0 25.6 21.9 21.9 33.8 33.8 33.8 33.8 34.6 34.6 47.2 22.5 23.6 21.5 25.0 25.6 <	Cermany	23.0	27.2	82.2	80.3	77.7	79.1	37.1	36.0	4100	7 (7	٠ ر	× ×	7.9		.288	.287	.288	
18.4 24.1 26.9 21.8 89.7 87.5 83.0 76.7 44.7 46.1 40.6 43.6 2.7 52.8 14.0 16.6 306 290 17.9 23.0 74.2 78.2 79.9 33.8 38.2 38.2 4.8 4.3 5.2 8.1 9.8 260 256 266 15.9 19.9 77.2 65.0 71.7 36.3 29.4 31.0 4.8 3.5 3.4 223 231 17.9 21.7 77.2 65.0 71.7 36.3 29.4 31.0 4.8 3.5 3.0 4.2 19.3 335 13.3 14.2 40.0 44.6 42.2 22.5 23.6 21.5 15.3 1335 338	Ireland	17.0	13.6					:	2	?	7,7	7.0	4	ر. د. د	9.0	.244	.257	.272	.264
26.9 21.8 89.7 87.5 83.0 76.7 44.7 46.1 40.6 43.6 2.7 11.4 14.0 16.6 .306 .290 17.9 23.0 74.2 78.2 79.9 33.8 38.2 38.2 4.8 4.3 5.2 8.1 9.8 .260 .256 .266 28.8 28.6 85.7 80.3 83.9 82.7 52.1 49.1 50.3 43.6 4.8 3.5 3.0 4.2 .318 333 333 333 343 17.9 21.7 77.2 65.0 71.7 36.3 29.4 31.0 4.8 3.5 3.0 4.2 .318 .335 338 13.3 14.2 40.0 44.6 42.2 22.5 23.6 21.5 25.0 25.6 21.9 335 338	Italy	18.4	24.1		,								2.8	0.4.	17.2		.328	.333	.323
17.9 23.0 74.2 78.2 79.9 33.8 38.2 38.2 4.8 4.3 5.2 8.1 9.8 2.60 2.56 2.66	Netherlands	56.9	21.8	89.7	87.5	83.0	76.7	44.7	46.1	40 6	43.6	7.0	4. (0.4	9.9		.306	.290	.333
15.9 19.9 28.8 28.6 85.7 80.3 82.7 52.1 49.1 50.3 43.6 4.8 3.5 12.2 16.1 318 33.3 33.3 33.3 17.9 21.7 77.2 65.0 71.7 36.3 29.4 31.0 12.5 18.5 15.7 21.9 22.9 13.3 14.2 40.0 44.6 42.2 22.5 23.6 21.5 25.0 25.6 21.9 25.0 25.6 21.9 33.8 33.8	Norway	17.9	23.0		74.2	78.2	79.9		33.8	38.2	38.0	/ 7	7.5	- ·	8. 8.	.260	.256	.266	.248
28.8 28.6 85.7 80.3 82.7 52.1 49.1 50.3 43.6 4.8 3.5 16.1 .318 .303 .353 17.9 21.7 77.2 65.0 71.7 36.3 29.4 31.0 12.5 18.5 15.3 .197 .218 .229 13.3 14.2 40.0 44.6 42.2 22.5 23.6 21.5 25.0 25.6 21.9 .335 .338	Spain	15.9	19.9						!	1	7.00	, t	4.5	5.2	3.4	.223	233	.231	.251
17.9 21.7 77.2 65.0 71.7 36.3 29.4 31.0 12.5 18.5 15.3 303 336 13.3 14.2 40.0 44.6 42.2 22.5 23.6 21.5 25.0 25.0 25.6 21.9 335 338	Sweden	28.8	28.6	85.7	80.3	83.9	82.7	52.1	40 1	503	757	/7/		12.2	16.1	.318	.303	.353	.340
13.3 14.2 40.0 44.6 42.2 22.5 23.6 21.5 25.0 25.6 21.9 335 338 338	ž	17.9	21.7		77.2	65.0	7 17	į	. 2	20.7	5.5	4. Ö	3.5	3.0	4.2	.197	.218	.229	.252
25.0 25.6 21.9 .335 .338	NSA	13.3	14.2		40.0	44.6	42.2		22.5	23.6	2.5		5.5	18.5	15.3		.303	.336	.345
										2			0.62	55.6	21.9		.335	.338	.368

ss: See Appendix 2.2 for data sources and details of calculatio